

Assessing Gender Mainstreaming to Ensure Gender Equity and Equality in Education, Social and Economic Sectors. The Case of Amhara Region, Ethiopia

Alemayehu Bishaw
Bahir dar University, Ethiopia

Abstract

The purpose of this study was to assess the implementation of gender mainstreaming as a fundamental strategy in insuring gender equity and equality in Amhara Region, Ethiopia. To conduct the study, six regional bureaus and seven corresponding worreda offices were selected by standing committee members of the Council of Amhara Region. Data was collected from Heads or Vice Heads of the Regional Bureaus and Worreda Offices and Gender focal persons and twenty employees from each Regional and Worreda Offices. Various data collection instruments, such as, questionnaire, interview, FGD and document analysis were employed. Both quantitative and qualitative data analysis techniques were used. The results of the analysis revealed that though there are adequate legal frameworks to implement gender mainstreaming in the education, other social and economic sectors in Amhara Region, when the achievements are measured in terms of gender mainstreaming dimensions, they fell short of the standards in all criteria set for gender mainstreaming. Based on the findings recommendations are forwarded. That is, the implementation is entangled with inadequacy of gender mainstreaming specific policies, adequate budget, networking, gender responsive human resource planning and implementation, monitoring and evaluation systems, etc.

Introduction

Ethiopia is a multi linguistic and multicultural country that constitutes around 80 nations and nationalities. The country is divided into 9 regions and two administrative cities. The capital city, the largest city, is Addis Ababa. The country has also registered a double digit economic growth for the last eight consecutive years. Currently, the country is engaged in huge investment on power, road and telecom construction to meet the growing demand of the economy. Besides, the country exhibits many social changes. The countries overall development can be ensured if there is integrated development in social, political and economic spheres. In doing so, the government has set and enacted various legal and policy frameworks to ensure gender equality in general and women specific problems in particular.

Without ensuring equal participation in development exercises and benefits to

both sexes, it is unthinkable to sustain national development. With this strong belief and dedication, the government of Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia is working hard to realize equal participation of men and women in every walk of life. However, the depth of the problem and the complexities of relations that follow gender issue and the prevailing societal conceptions make the solution tougher than one can imagine. With this conception, the government has addressed gender equality as one of constitutional pillars. Following the constitution of the country, various policies, legislations and laws are formulated and put in to effect. Therefore, it is time to examine the adequate integration of gender issues in the policies, laws and legislations in political, social and economic spheres and their impacts on empowering women.

Assessing Gender Mainstreaming in Ethiopian Laws, Legislation and Policies

Gender mainstreaming as a concept introduced in 1985 during the United Nations Third World Conference on Women in Nairobi, which is now almost over twenty years (SUCDA Development consultants, 2008). The United Nations defined gender mainstreaming as: The process of assessing the implications for women of any planned action including legislation, policies or programs in all areas and at all levels. It is a strategy for making women's as well as men's concerns and experiences an integral dimension of the design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation of policies and programs in all political economic and societal spheres so that women and men benefit equally, and inequality is not perpetuated (Neimanis, 2001).

Gender mainstreaming is the current international approach to advancing gender equality. In order to achieve sustainable development, men's and women's empowerment and their full participation on the basis of equality in all spheres of the society are fundamental (MoWA, 2006). In relation to this, Fetenu and Sosen (2002) argued that the principle of equally integrating men and women in the development process as participants in planning, policy making and as beneficiaries has now become widely accepted by governments throughout the world.

The issue of gender equality has become an area of concern in development planning during the last few decades. The marginalization of women for long from development programs called for changes in policy perspective from women in development (WID) which aims at engaging women in development projects to Gender and Development (GAD) which aims at addressing inequalities in women's and men's social roles (March et al, 1999, cited in Ethiopian Society of Population Studies, 2008).

Ethiopia has been part of this global movement in advancing gender equality, which is cemented by the existence of the country's constitution, National Policy on Ethiopian Women, the newly amended Family Law and the government's ratification of the Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW). However, making it instrumental to ensure men's and women's access to resources, opportunities and treatment is so critical.

Different sources (MoWA, 2006) explained that gender inequality is one of the features of Ethiopian society. As a result, there is unequal power and economic relation between women and men. In almost all spheres of life, women are more disadvantaged than men. Addressing gender mainstreaming in development is, therefore, not only about equality but also about social justice.

An official document released from the Ministry of Women's Affairs (2006) further stated that countries will not be able to alleviate problems related to poverty and HIV/AIDS pandemic and ensure sustainable development without a deliberate attempt to overcome gender inequality. Gender mainstreaming is the core strategy to eliminate gender inequalities which in return helps to ensure sustainable development in a given country. In other words, equal rights and opportunities for women and men are practical preconditions for sustainable development (MoWA, 2006).

Moser (1993) classified two approaches of development i.e WID- women in development, and GAD- gender and development. The core point of WID is that development policies and programs had excluded women, entrenching economic inequalities rather than fostering equal opportunities between women and men. The aim of WID is, hence, to integrate women in to the existing institutions. GAD aims at filling the short comings of WID, i.e, addressing the gender relations between men and women. It aims at reshaping power relations which has resulted in unequal gender relations which in return created unbalanced development participation between men and women (CRTD. A, 2005). All social, economic, political structures and development policies are subject to gender analysis, and it recognized that gender equity requires transformative change and not merely the integration of women in to existing economic structures (CIDA, 2000).

Document Analysis of the FDRE Constitution and Proclamations 176/2010 of the council of The Amhara Regional State.

An attempt was made to assess the FDRE Constitution and Proclamation 176/2010 of Amhara regional state to examine as to whether gender mainstreaming as instrumental to gender equity and equality has been given legal and constitutional backing. The analysis was made by taking into account the Articles and Sub Articles as units of measurement.

Article 25 of The FDRE constitution states (The Right to equality)

All persons are equal before the law and are entitled without any discrimination to the equal protection of the law. In this respect, the law shall guarantee to all persons equal and effective protection without discrimination on grounds of race, nation, nationality, or other social origin, colors, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, property, birth or other status.

Article 35 of the FDRE Constitution (the Right of Women) constitutes nine sub articles and deals with all sorts of women's rights, such as, equality of women with men,

equality in marriage, the right to receive affirmative measures, the right to eliminate the influences of harmful customs, the right to maternity leave with full pay, equal right to participate in national development issues, equal right to property ownership, equal right to employment and the right to family planning education.

Article 38 of The FDRE Constitution also takes into account women's right to vote and to be elected. Similarly, all articles dealing with democratic rights have considerably emphasized the equality of sexes.

The document analysis has also been made on proclamation 176/2010, The Amhara National Regional State Executive Organs Re-Establishment and determinants of their powers and duties Proclamation. Article 11, sub article G states 'Carry out its duties in such a way as to ensure the Constitutional entitlement of women by having incorporated the principle of gender equality in its plan.'

Similarly, Article 26 explains the roles and duties of The Bureau of Women's, Children's and youth's affairs. In this regard, Sub Article 1 of Article 26 states "Initiate proposals with the view to enforcing the rights and interests of women's children's and youth's in the Regional State as well as devise implementation strategies and carry out the necessary follow-ups."

In the same vein, sub Article 2 states

'Provide the necessary follow up and support for the Regional Government bodies in the course of their preparation of policies, laws, development, programs, projects and reports by having formulated a mechanism enabling them to mainstream gender issues and thereby ensure the participation and entitlement of women in such process.'

The remaining duties and responsibilities of The Bureau of Women's, Children's and Youth's Affairs' mentioned in the Proclamation are devoted to ensure gender equality. The document analysis has portrayed that there is adequate legal backing to realize gender mainstreaming and thereby ensure gender equity and gender equality.

Gender and Development approach believes that the challenges and opportunities of women empowerment and as result gender equality are examined through the proper implementation of gender mainstreaming. That is, the challenges to empower women can be resolved through the effective implementation of gender mainstreaming in organizations. This implies that the need to address women's empowerment remains pressing in gender mainstreaming. AusAID (2011) explains why the empowerment of women is important by addressing the fundamental issues that gender equality is central to economic and human development. This is due to the fact that in gender mainstreaming, priority outcomes include the economic status of women, equal participation of women in decision-making in leadership and improved equitable health and education outcomes. Cognizant of the current trend in gender mainstreaming, this study attempts to answer the following basic question.

Basic questions

- Do Regional Bureaus and Worreda Offices in Amhara Region implement gender mainstreaming?

Purpose of the Study

This study intends to examine Proclamations, laws, legislations, policies and plans at federal and regional level for their adequate integration of gender mainstreaming and as to whether the executive bodies implement gender mainstreaming. This is with the assumption that the current trend in gender and development theory, challenges and opportunities of women's empowerment and through it to gender equality are assessed in terms of the extent to which gender mainstreaming is addressed in the organizations.

Significance of the study

The results of this study will be significant to policy makers, legislative decision makers to know to what extent gender mainstreaming is incorporated in the Ethiopian laws, proclamations, plans and reports and if found inadequate to make amendments. This study also helps the executive bodies and the education sector in Amhara Region to examine the extent of their organizations commitment to mainstream gender to ensure gender equity and equality and take corrective measures.

Method of the Research

The purpose of this research was to examine the effective implementation of gender mainstreaming in Amhara region. In doing so, both qualitative and quantitative research approaches were employed.

Population of the study and samples

The target populations of this study are Regional Bureaus. These include Education Bureau, Technical and Vocational Education Bureau, Women, Youth and Children Bureau, Agriculture Bureau, Environmental Protection and Land Administration Bureau and Small Scale Enterprises Bureau and the corresponding offices at Worreda level in Amhara region. Purposeful and random sampling techniques were employed to select respondents from regional bureaus and worreda offices in Amhara Region. Purposeful sampling was employed to select relevant documents to be evaluated. Particularly, these documents include the plans and reports of the regional bureaus and worreda offices.

To assess the factors influencing gender mainstreaming purposeful sampling was used to select Regional Bureaus. Forty two corresponding Worreda offices from seven

Worredas were selected using random sampling technique. Heads or Vice Heads of the Regional Bureaus and Worreda Offices and Gender focal persons were purposefully selected. Twenty employees from each Regional and Worreda Offices were selected randomly to fill the questionnaire.

Data collection Instruments

In this study, various data collection instruments were utilized. They include questionnaire, interview and focus group discussion (FGD). Document analysis was also used to assess the adequate integration of gender issues on plans and reports

The major data collection instrument that was employed in this study was questionnaire. The questionnaire was planned to solicit information about the effective implementation of gender mainstreaming in various regional bureaus and worreda offices. In other words, the questionnaire was used to examine the availability and practicality of gender mainstreaming in various organizations. The questionnaire constitutes items that measure the implementation of gender mainstreaming dimensions. The dimensions include policy, human resource, awareness and attitude, budget and resource, strategy, communication and research, networking, planning and monitoring and evaluation (Fetenu and Sosena, 2002).

The other data collection instrument used in this study was interview. Interview was used to get relevant data from Heads or Vice Heads of the Regional Bureaus and worreda offices and gender focal persons and three employees. The results of the interview were used to substantiate the results obtained through the questionnaire and document analysis. Similarly, FGD was conducted in worreda offices. FGD was conducted to get additional information about the implementation of gender mainstreaming in each office. However, the attempt to conduct FGD in regional bureaus has failed due to the interest of time.

Data Analysis Techniques

To examine the effective implementation of gender mainstreaming in the region, one sample t-test was employed. That is nine one sample t-tests were conducted in each dimensions of gender mainstreaming. The results obtained through the interview and FGD are analyzed based on the nine gender mainstreaming dimensions.

Data presentation, Analysis and Interpretation Introduction

This part deals with the analysis of results obtained through the questionnaire, interview and FGD. A total of 574 questionnaires were distributed to the employees both at regional and worreda level. Of these, only 497 were returned. Again a critical evaluation and screening of the data was made, only 480 questionnaires were found

properly filled and legible for analysis. In addition to the questionnaire, interview was used as data collection instrument. At the beginning 468 employees from regional bureaus and worreda offices was planned. However, when the actual data collection took place, several reasons restricted the number of employees to be interviewed to 236. Focus group discussion was also held in each Worreda. Due to the interest of time, it was found difficult to conduct FGD at regional bureaus. Finally, the results obtained through the three data collection instruments are presented and analyzed in this section.

Table 1: One sample t-test on mainstreaming Policy/strategies/guidelines

| N | df | SD | Expected mean | Observed mean | Sig. |
|-----|-----|-----|---------------|---------------|------|
| 480 | 479 | 4.4 | 24 | 14.66 | .000 |

The availability of gender mainstreaming policy, strategy/guideline and as to whether or not the organizations' vision, mission and objectives are gender responsive, questionnaire was dispatched to employees of six regional bureaus and seven worreda offices. The findings indicated that the observed and the expected means were 14.66 and 24 respectively. A one sample t-test was computed for further analyses of the significance level using the pre-determined value for the variable. Accordingly, the expected mean was compared against the observed mean. The findings revealed that the expected mean significantly differed from the observed mean in favor of the expected mean. This implies that there are no policies/strategies/guidelines or the employees do not know the availability of the policies.

The interview made with gender focal persons has also ascertained the quantitative result that except Bureau of Environmental Protection and Land Administration which states that there is guideline sent from Women Youth and Children Affairs Bureau, the rest of regional and worreda offices do not have gender mainstreaming policy/strategy or guideline. The issue here is the majority of respondents do not know its presence.

The majority of interviewees, 69% respondents, replied that there is no policy regarding gender mainstreaming and they further mentioned that this might be due to the large amount of responsibilities of our organization. However 21% respondents stated that they are using the gender policy developed by the region. When they are asked about the contents of the policy, they couldn't list down the contents of the policy that address the gender issue. The remaining 10% respondents have reported that they do not know whether there is or not a context specific gender policy or guideline in their organization

Table 2: One sample t-test on human resource management

| N | df | SD | Expected mean | Observed mean | Sig. |
|-----|-----|-----|---------------|---------------|------|
| 480 | 479 | 2.7 | 33 | 17.29 | .000 |

The questionnaire was administered to employees both at regional and worreda level in Amhara Region to examine as to whether the organizations' recruitment, training and promotion policy is in line with the principles of gender mainstreaming, to measure the organizations' efforts to eliminate gender stereotypes and availability of conducive working environment for women employees, One sample t-test was carried out for analysis. The results in Table 2 indicated that the obtained mean is significantly lower than the expected mean. This shows that the human resource planning and management is not as per the standard of gender mainstreaming principles.

The above result has been substantiated by the interview and FGD conducted with employees at regional and worreda level as to whether the human resource management considers gender equality. Nearly all interviewee and FGD participants have portrayed that the civil service guideline that states additional 3 points should be given for women in the competition for any job is properly implemented. However, equally, nearly all interviewee posited that they do not know any other strategy used in their organization to ensure gender equality.

Similarly, to the question whether there is incentive for women employees, the majority except in the Education Bureau and Worreda Education offices, said that there is no any incentive. However, the education offices indicated that there is only incentive to female students in the school. This includes rewarding best performing female students, creating a forum where female students compete each other and rewarding teachers who performed well in enhancing female students' academic achievement and female students are given tutorial support. As one type of the incentives, women employees are given priority to choose the place for field work. Similarly, in TVEs it is mentioned that efforts are being made to increase women's participation in Small Scale Enterprises.

The interview result has also indicated that gender related activities are integrated with other departments such as Extension Process Owner in Agriculture Bureau and Curriculum Process Owner in the Education Bureau and Worreda Education Offices through assigning focal persons.

An Interview was also conducted with leaders and experts at Worreda level as to whether there are efforts made to bring women to decision making positions. All respondents reported that there are no efforts made at Worreda level except some efforts made at kebele level to participate women in various committees.

The interview made with Worreda WYCO depicted that reward and giving recognition to best performing women is held during March 8 (International Women's Day). To encourage women aspire higher decision making positions and enhance their decision making role, attempts were made to bring renowned women from federal level to share their rich leadership experience.

The focus group discussants have reported that attempts are being made to increase females' participation in development activities, such as, participation in leadership position on a one-to-five team based organization, various income generating activities and command posts organized at kebele level.

Table3: One sample t-test on Awareness/Attitude

| N | df | SD | Expected mean | Observed mean | Sig. |
|-----|-----|-----|---------------|---------------|------|
| 480 | 479 | 2.8 | 24 | 18.23 | .000 |

One of the criteria to measure the adequate implementation of gender mainstreaming is the availability of continuous awareness creation system about gender and the extent of the employees' awareness and attitude level. To measure the availability of such a system, one sample t-test was employed on the data gathered through the questionnaire. The result in Table 3 revealed that the expected mean significantly exceeds the observed mean. This implies that the efforts made in realizing gender mainstreaming in general and awareness criteria in particular both at regional and worreda level needs much to be done.

The majority of interviewee 59% showed that there are no mechanisms through which the organizations disseminate gender related information to their employees, while relatively high number of respondents reported the availability of information dissemination system. They further stated that except the meetings organized by WCYO on unplanned/incidental basis, there is no planned training given to the employees.

When they are asked to list down the mechanisms to disseminate information, they stated that during planning orientation and report evaluation awareness creation orientation is given to consider gender desegregated data (male and female). During coffee ceremony to develop employees' awareness on HIV/AIDS, gender topics will be part of the discussion. Similarly, awareness training is given to students, the community and to adults together with adult literacy training. In the forums dealing with early marriage, gender issue raised as one issue of discussion.

Similarly, one respondent asserted that brochures are used to disseminate gender related information. During interview it was learnt that there are efforts rarely made to change the attitudinal problems in the organizations towards gender in cooperation with WYCO. However, in some worredas like Jile Timoga, it is reported that there is no any mechanism to disseminate gender information to the employees.

To the interview question "how does the organization's employees' knowledge and attitude looks like?", all respondents pointed out that though there is some improvement in the attitude of the employees, it is difficult to say that adequate awareness has been developed in the society. For instance, it is observed that the need to use females as the sources of income in the community is still increasing. Besides, the majority of respondents have reported that in rural parts of the region women are oppressed by their husbands. This oppression is substantiated by some religious practices.

Because of the societies low level of gender awareness, and the societies intention to practice early marriage below the age of 16, they are using different strategies, such as, sending the elder sister than the actual female child ready for marriage for checking the age for marriage and a different form of social gathering than marriage ceremony to disguise what is going on the family. As to one of the interviewee, this is an indication

that there is still attitudinal problem regarding gender. Furthermore, some respondents have portrayed that training is given to the school teachers, students and supervisors about family planning, HIV/AIDS and personal sanitation.

One interesting finding from the interview and FGD conducted with Regional and Worreda leaders and experts is that all of them believe that there is no problem concerning awareness and attitude towards gender. Equally, they believe that the problem prevails at Kebele (the last administration hierarchy) level.

During FGD one participant asserted that the awareness and attitudinal problems are so serious in rural areas. That is, husbands always claim that they should take the upper hand. Equally, wives believe that they are inferior to husbands. There is also a tendency by males to use religion as a means to exercise their authority over females. This is due to the low level of emphasis given in rural areas to promote gender awareness level of both males and females.

During FGD one female participant has clearly indicated how husbands abuse religious principles. She said that the Sheria law allows a male to marry until four wives provided that he has adequate wealth to manage the family fairly. Some of the practices, such as, practicing marriage with the sister-in-law after the death of her husband is not religiously rooted. It is rather traditional practice that prevailed for years. However, this type of marriage has created problem on women regarding land ownership. That is, when the land ownership registration took place only one of the wives is registered. This implies that the rest of wives will be deprived of land ownership.

Another important experience tapped from the interview and FGD (though not widely practiced) is that women are encouraged to claim leadership in development teams and One-to-five teams. Those who perform in these levels are transferred to higher positions. Besides, training is given to enhance their leadership capacity.

As to the emphasis given by the leadership to gender issues, the FGD result revealed that the role of the leadership to realize gender mainstreaming is a sort of lip service and for the sake of report. However, when practically measured they are not playing the required leadership role.

One of the participants in the FGD who represents WCYO reported that the other sectors are not dedicated to realize gender mainstreaming due to lack of strong belief on the issue. He further depicted that they consider gender issues as the task assigned only to WCYO. Similarly, they wrongly perceive our efforts to collect gender related reports as if we are undertaking monitoring and controlling their activities. This result contradicts with the interview and FGD results mentioned above that there is no attitudinal problem at regional and worreda level.

The above result has been supported by the FGD made at worreda level. The FGD discussants have pointed out that despite the fact that several awareness creation forums are put in place, it is difficult to conclude that adequate awareness is achieved among the employees. Especially, males' gender awareness is below what is supposed to be. As a result, they are creating burden/problem on their wives to attend meetings and to

participate in income generating activities. The same person outlined that there is also a problem in the participants of the training. That is, the same people are selected to usually participate in awareness creation forums. As a result, it was found difficult to extend awareness to the wider population.

Table 4: One sample t-test on Budget and Resources

| N | df | SD | Expected mean | Observed mean | Sig. |
|-----|-----|----|---------------|---------------|------|
| 480 | 479 | .7 | 9 | 3.5 | .000 |

Budget and resource allocation and their effective utilization to run gender related activities is one of the criteria to measure the effective implementation of gender mainstreaming. In this study, an attempt was made to examine whether selected regional bureaus and worreda offices allocate the adequate budget and resources to put in effect gender mainstreaming. Besides, an attempt was made to see whether the management is committed to use the budget allocated. In doing so, One-sample t-test was employed for analysis. The result in Table 4 depicted that the performance of the regional bureaus and worreda offices is below the required standard. That is, the expected mean (9) significantly exceeds the observed mean (3.5).

The interview results have also posited that there is no budget particularly allocated for gender related activities. This might be due to the budget breakdown already fixed during planning. However, the respondents were not courageous to mention whether the leadership is committed or not to use the budget for gender related activities.

Table 5: One sample t-test on Organization

| N | df | SD | Expected mean | Observed mean | Sig. |
|-----|-----|----|---------------|---------------|------|
| 480 | 479 | .7 | 6 | 3.14 | .000 |

To assess the availability of any system or strategy accountable to implement and seek solutions to problems related to gender, one sample t-test was carried out. The result in Table 5 posited that the observed mean is significantly lower than the expected mean. This indicates that the regional bureaus and Worreda offices in the region have not established a strategic approach to address gender issues in their day-to-day routines.

Interview was conducted with experts in the seven Worredas and six regional bureaus about the presence of a system to enhance women’s participation in decision making capacity. All respondents indicated that there is no any system. However, the Education Offices portrayed that attempts are being made at school level. They stated that schools are playing significant roles in enhancing women’s decision making capacity through various mechanisms, such as, children’s parliament, class monitor and assigning female students in clubs.

Interview was also held with Worred offices about the availability of structure in the organization to manage gender activities.

The focus group discussion made with Worreda experts in Borrena has indicated that even though there are efforts to enhance women’s participation in Small Scale Enterprises, the practical result proves that there is gender gap in the actual sense of reality.

In another worreda one respondent reported that our office is primarily working on enhancing knowledge but not on economic activities.

Table 6: One sample t-test on Publication

| N | df | SD | Expected mean | Observed mean | Sig. |
|-----|-----|------|---------------|---------------|------|
| 480 | 479 | 1,58 | 15 | 8.95 | .000 |

This study tried to evaluate the availability of communications, research undertakings and other media to promote gender equality. The study also tried to examine the efforts made to take records of important achievements concerning gender. In doing so, one sample t-test was employed. The result in Table 6 depicted that much has not been done regarding using various channels to disseminate gender related information and knowledge. That is, the mean comparison of the observed and the expected means proved that the expected mean significantly exceeds the obtained mean and the difference is found to be highly significant.

The interview result has augmented that the Education offices have better practices in recording gender based data. As compared to other Bureaus and Worreda offices, the education sector believed that they well organized gender desegregated data.

Nearly all Worreda Interviewees have reported that there are no gender clubs in their offices. However, they pointed out that schools are exercising clubs, such as, gender clubs. The gender clubs in schools are working to report early marriage attempts in the community, sexual harassment and teach about health and family planning through dramas.

Table 7: One sample t-test on Networking

| N | df | SD | Expected mean | Observed mean | Sig. |
|-----|-----|------|---------------|---------------|------|
| 480 | 479 | 1.72 | 12 | 7.46 | .000 |

To effectively implement gender mainstreaming, experience and resource sharing is taken as one important strategy. Thus, establishing good relation with various organizations working on gender is of paramount importance. The quantitative analysis was made using one sample t-test. Similar results are obtained. That is, the performance of the regional and worreda offices regarding networking is not as it is expected to be.

The interview results showed that the majority of respondents from different offices

have indicated that there are no networks with organizations working on gender while few respondents claimed that they have networks with ADA and LK10, justice office, police, Women Children Youth Office (WCYO),

In addition, some Worreda offices, such as, TVE, have reported that they are working with Worreda office of Agriculture in terms of creating job opportunity for women. They further reported that they work in cooperation with Mention-for-Mention organization and Amhara Credit Association regarding entrepreneurs and credit services for women. In one Worreda the experts have indicated that there are projects to train women in Beauty Salon.

In the FGD it is also mentioned that in cooperation with the Orthodox church one Worreda office works to enable rural house wives to participate in horticulture and sheep fattening. One NGO (Fire Senai) is working with Worreda Education office to reward best performing female students. This organization constructs dormitories for best performing female students. It was also mentioned in the FGD that females are also given priority in revolving credit services

Table 8: One sample t-test on Planning

| N | df | SD | Expected mean | Observed mean | Sig. |
|-----|-----|-----|---------------|---------------|------|
| 480 | 479 | 1.6 | 12 | 7.72 | .000 |

The other criterion to measure the effective implementation of gender mainstreaming is integrating gender as a central part of the organization’s plan. This can be manifested through the way the plan is developed, its concern to scale up women’s participation and benefits, considering sex desegregated data, etc. To measure as to whether the regional bureaus and worried offices have developed gender responsive planning, one sample t-test was used. The result in Table 8 conveyed significant difference between the expected mean and the obtained mean in favor of the expected mean. This implies that both the interview and FGD results have revealed that the plan adequately considers gender. The qualitative results through interview indicated that the majority believe that the plan is gender sensitive. That is, the short term and long term plan of the offices is made to consider sex in the human resource data. However, when they are asked to elaborate what aspects of gender are incorporated in the plan, nearly all participants in interview and FGD said that during planning the data is presented in sex desegregated manner. However, no respondent has talked about whether the plan incorporates the issue of satisfying the practical and strategic needs of women, bringing women in decision making positions, empowering women and creating the organizational climate to be conducive for women employees. In one Worreda FGD discussants have pointed out that much effort is being made to protect women’s rights and make them benefit in all walks of life. However, in an indepth interview the same person has reported that the worreda is a place where many women migrate to Arab countries. This is due to low job opportunity available in the

worreda

Table 9: one sample t-test on Monitoring and Evaluation

| N | df | SD | Expected mean | Observed mean | Sig. |
|-----|-----|------|---------------|---------------|------|
| 480 | 479 | 1.70 | 12 | 6 | .000 |

One sample t-test was carried out to examine the presence of continuous monitoring and evaluation of gender related activities and recording important experiences and achievements on gender. The results of the analysis portrayed that the expected mean (12) is greater than the obtained mean (6). The difference was found to be significant at 0.000 alpha level in favor of the expected mean. This implies that the monitoring and evaluation practices held at regional and worreda levels do not meet the expected level.

To the question as to whether there is continuous monitoring and evaluation of activities related to gender, nearly all replied that there is no well organized system of evaluating the activities in terms of gender responsiveness. However, the issue of sex desegregation is taken into account in all activities.

One respondent has clearly pointed out the monitoring and evaluation practices that prevail regarding gender. He said that the gender issue is an arbitrary act that is performed one time taking it as a focal issue and the other time totally forgotten.

Concerning monitoring and evaluation, the focus group discussion has shown the presence of a problem emanated from the absence of qualified professionals in the structure of WCYB starting from the region to worredas that monitor and support the gender related activities.

Discussion of the Results

This study aimed at evaluating the effectiveness of gender mainstreaming in Amhara Region. The results of document analysis on the FDRE Constitution and Proclamation 176/2010 of the Amhara Regional State have proved that there are adequate legal frameworks to implement gender mainstreaming in the region. However, availability of legal frameworks are the necessary but not the sufficient conditions to realize gender equality in the region. Equally having workable standards of implementing gender mainstreaming is an important step. In this regard, the analysis was also made taking into account standards or criteria to measure gender mainstreaming. This includes inclusion of gender as the major component of the organization's policy and strategy, whether the human resource management has considered gender issue, the knowledge and skill development of the organization addresses the issue, allocation of adequate budget to mainstream gender, the emphasis given to gender starting from planning process to monitoring and evaluation.

Based on the quantitative and qualitative results, it has been found out that the

mission and vision of statements of the partner institutions did not include gender issue. This was directly checked from the written vision and mission statements as they are posted in front of the buildings of the organizations. However, the effective implementation of any activity has to be guided by the overall philosophy of the organizations. Some bureaus and Worredas have also reported that they have policies drawn from other institutions but they do not have their own policy and strategy to mainstream gender that addresses the organizations unique features. Unless, it is clearly indicated in the policy statements, the implementation of gender mainstreaming cannot be fully realized or it becomes an arbitrary and incidental work. This was proved during data collection that the researchers couldn't find well arranged, planned and documented activities made by the organizations to mainstream gender.

There appeared high consistency of results between the quantitative and qualitative data obtained. That is, one sample t-test result has shown that the implementation of human resource management is below the expected level when compared with the criterion of gender mainstreaming. The qualitative data analysis has also posited that except the civil service guideline which states that additional 3 points should be given for female employees, the regional bureaus and worreda offices were not seen creating conducive working environment for female employees, creating an opportunity for women to come to decision making positions and eliminating gender stereotypes.

Similarly, except few practices observed in providing incentives for women employees, such as, for students in schools and giving recognition for best performing women on March 8, there is no well organized system to enhance women's self-confidence and empowerment.

However, though not explicitly observed in many regional bureaus and worreda offices, one important experience has been drawn from this study. That is, one or two worredas are observed using a One-to-five team based organization as starting point to allow women exercise leadership skills. This important experience should be transcended to all regional and worredas organizations.

Awareness

To promote gender awareness and change the already established misconceptions about gender and thereby realize gender equality in organizations, availability of continuous training plays important role. Concerning awareness, the result of one sample t-test, however, suggested that it is below the standard in terms of the criterion used to measure its adequacy. The results of interview and FGDs conducted also clearly show that there are problems related to awareness and attitude of employees regarding gender.

One of the significant findings in this study is that all regional and worreda employees' belief about the absence of awareness and attitude problems related to gender. This seems mere complacency that requires strong intervention. In the presence of such belief, it is unthinkable to implement gender mainstreaming in regional bureaus and

worreda offices. This idea was well articulated by one expert from WCYO who reported that regional bureaus and worreda offices other than WCYB/O do not consider gender issue as their prime concern; rather they believe that it is the responsibility of WCYB/O. He continued to say that any effort to collect report from these offices was not positively perceived. The training has not achieved its intention to transcend the knowledge to the community. Furthermore, in some areas where NGOs give gender training, some misconceptions have been identified about the purpose of the training workshops; that is people considered the training as the source of income in the form of per diem than scaling up the impacts of the training to those who did not get the opportunity.

Budget

Similar results are obtained from one sample t-test, interview and focus group discussion that there is no budget particularly allocated for implementing gender mainstreaming. In the absence of adequate budget and resources and a committed management to run gender related activities, realizing gender mainstreaming will be very difficult. This might have emanated from the overall low level of awareness employees, experts and the management at regional and worreda level possess. There is a growing conception that gender issue has to be integrated with the major activities of the organizations. However, when the plan and the reports of the regional bureaus and worreda offices are evaluated, there are no clearly set parts of the plan that address gender issue.

Communications

In this study, it was found out that there are little/no communications, research undertakings and other media to promote gender equality. It was also found out that there no efforts made to take records of important achievements concerning gender. Attempts have been made to collect various forms of communication means, such as, magazines, pamphlets, newsletters and short communications. A glance look at very few magazines and newsletters has shown that less emphasis is given to gender issues.

Monitoring and Evaluation

The majority of respondents do not know what is going on to assess the effectiveness of gender mainstreaming. This data have indicated that there is no any accountability system that follows the successful implementation of gender related activities and resolves when problems arise. Similarly, the researchers couldn't find any report at regional level about the successful implementation of gender mainstreaming.

Conclusion and Recommendation

Even though great deals of activities have been done to materialize gender equality in the region, when the achievements are measured in terms of gender mainstreaming dimensions, they are fallen short of the standards in all criteria set for gender mainstreaming. That is, gender mainstreaming to ensure gender equality has been well addressed in different legal and policy documents in Amhara Region. However, the practice shows that mainstreaming gender is not yet taken as central to the government organizations' plans, implementation, monitoring and evaluation and budgeting. The concept gender mainstreaming is not well understood by heads of bureaus and employees of the government organizations included in this study.

Implications for future directions

- Important experiences drawn from each Worreda should be well documented and cascaded to other Worredas
- The concept of gender mainstreaming together with its dimensions is not well known as a strategy to realize gender equality. Thus, much has to be done to introduce the concept to regional and worreda leaders, experts and employees.
- The framework for gender mainstreaming should be developed by the regional government and distributed to the regional bureaus and the regional bureaus should develop context specific gender mainstreaming guideline.
- The concept of gender mainstreaming should be included in the functional adult literacy education.
- One of the important experiences drawn from this study is the use of one-to-five team based organization as a forum for women to exercise leadership capacity. This experience should be transcended to the regional bureaus and worreda offices to materialize women's decision making role and thereby ensure gender equality.
- Another fascinating result found in this study is the conception of nearly all employees at regional and worreda levels that there is no awareness and attitudinal problem. This is the misconception that calls for strong intervention.

References

- AusAID (2011). Promoting Opportunities for All. Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment. Thematic Strategy, Australian Agency for International Development.
- CIDA. (2000). Accelerating Change Resource for Gender Mainstreaming. Quebec. Gatineau.
- CRTD-A. (2005). "Building Capacities on Gender Mainstreaming". A Training Module, with the support of Fredric Ebert Stiftung (unpublished).
- Ethiopian Society of Population Studies. (2008). "Gender Inequality and Women's Empowerment". Addis Ababa.

- Fetenu, Bekele and Sosena Demissie. (2002) “Gender Mainstreaming Strategy in Amhara National Regional State”, Vol. I, Final Draft. Bahir Dar. Ethiopia.
- MOFED. (2006). “The socio-Economic and Political situation of women in Amhara Region”. Ethiopia. Bahir Dar.
- Moser, C. (1993). Gender planning and Development: Theory, practice and Training. London. Routledge
- MOWA. (2006) “National Action plan for Gender Equality (2006-2010)”. Final Draft Addis Ababa.
- Neimanis, Astrida. (2001). Gender Mainstreaming in Practice: Hand Book, UNDP. RBEC.
- SUDCA Development Consultants. (2008). “Gender mainstreaming, Leadership, Community Mobilization and Participatory Approach”. Training Manual. Addis Abeba
- The Constitution of The Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia. Addis Ababa
- The Council of the Amhara Regional State. Proclamation No. 176/2010.
- The Council of the Amhara Regional state. The Amhara National Regional Executive Organs Re-Establishment and Determination of Their Powers and Duties Proclamation. January 14/ 2010, Bahir Dar.