Margaret Mitchell の Gone with the Wind と
William Faulkner の “A Rose for Emily”
——旧南部への執着

大地 真介

Margaret Mitchell の Gone with the Wind（1936）は、世界で最も読まれたアメリカ南部文学である。同書は、1937年にプーリツァー賞に輝き、出版直後の一年間だけで約150万部売れてアメリカの出版史上最速の売れ行きとなった（Jacobe 112）。今もなお世界中で読まれ続けており、これまでに2800万部以上売れている。その映画化作品は、アカデミー賞の9部門で受賞し、観客動員数はいまだに世界一である（Haskell 5-6）。

本論文では、世界で最も知られた南部文学 Gone with the Wind における旧南部（the Old South）への執着について、William Faulkner の“A Rose for Emily”（1930）を手掛かりにして考察してみたい。“A Rose for Emily”を取り上げたのは、同作品が、傑出した南部作家 Faulkner の代表作の一つであり、また、同作品は、Gone with the Wind と同様、1930年代に発表された南部小説で、おおむね、南北戦争によって多大な被害を受けた南部の旧貴族の女性を主人公としているからである。

まず、旧南部、すなわち南北戦争前の南部社会について確認しておきたい。旧南部の最大の特徴は、黒人奴隸制度を有していたことであり、南部社会は、人種的、民族的にも階級的にもジェンダー的にも大きな問題を抱えていた。アメリカは自由と平和を謳う国であるにもかかわらず、南部には、黒人奴隷および彼ら／彼女らから搾取する白人貴族が存在していたのである。また、黒人奴隸制度を正当化するために南部の白人たちは、聖書が奴隷制を容認していると主張するだけでなく、妻子を庇護するために「愚かで無能な」黒人を守ってやっているのだと主張した。この父親的温情主義（paternalism）により、南部では父権制が極めて強固だったのである（Wilson 106, 203）。ただし、このような南部は、南北戦争での敗北に伴う奴隸制度廃止によって劇的な変化を受けることとなった。旧南部社会の問題は、“A Rose for Emily”と Gone with the Wind に色濃く反映されていると筆者は考える。

まずは、“A Rose for Emily”からみていかきたい。下記の描写から窺えるように、“A Rose for Emily”の主人公である名門 Grierson 家の末裔 Emily Grierson は没落貴族である。“It [Emily’s house] was a big, squarish frame house that had once been white, . . . set on what had
once been our most select street. But garages and cotton gins had encroached and obliterated even the august names of that neighborhood; only Miss Emily’s house was left, lifting its stubborn and coquettish decay above the cotton wagons and the gasoline pumps: an eyesore among eyesores” (119). “When her [Emily’s] father died, it got about that the house was all that was left to her” (123). “[Emily] had some kin in Alabama; but years ago her father had fallen out with them over the estate of old lady Wyatt, the crazy woman, and there was no communication between the two families” (125). Jeffersonの町の人々は、このEmilyが北部人のHomer Barronを愛していることに驚くが、南北戦争後も貴族として生きようとするEmilyは（Brooks and Warren 409-14）、旧南部を支配していた父権制にとらわれるあまり（父親）に過剰に執着し、父親に似たHomerに夢中になっているのである。見まったく違うタイプのように見えるEmilyの父親とHomerが実は似た者同士だということを以下で示したい。

Homerは、死体としてEmilyに愛されるという点で彼女の父親に似ているとIrving Malinは指摘しているが（37）、両者は生前も似た存在である。大きな共通点として、まず、Jack Schertingも述べているように（401）、二人とも「鞭」を持ったマッチョなイメージでとらえられている。2

People in our town, remembering how old lady Wyatt, her great-aunt, had gone completely crazy at last, believed that the Griersons held themselves a little too high for what they really were. None of the young men were quite good enough for Miss Emily and such. We had long thought of them as a tableau, Miss Emily a slender figure in white in the background, her father a spraddled silhouette in the foreground, his back to her and clutching a horsewhip, the two of them framed by the back-flung front door. . . . We remembered all the young men her father had driven away. . . . (123-24)

[Emily and Homer] passed on Sunday afternoon in the glittering buggy, Miss Emily with her head high and Homer Barron with his hat cocked and a cigar in his teeth, reins and whip in a yellow glove. (126)

Emilyの父親とHomerの二つの大きな共通点は、両者ともEmilyの結婚を軽視していることである。Emilyの父親は、先ほどの引用にもあったように、Emilyの結婚よりもGrierson家の格式を重視しており、また，“When she [Emily] had first begun to be seen with Homer Barron, we had said, ‘She will marry him.’ Then we said, ‘She will persuade him yet,’”
because Homer himself had remarked—he liked men, and it was known that he drank with the younger men in the Elks’ Club—that he was not a marrying man” (126) とあるように、HomerはEmilyと結婚する気はさらさらないのである。

Emilyの父親とHomerの三つ目の重要な共通点は、二人ともEmilyとは結婚できない存在だということである。彼女が父親と結婚することは、言うまでもなく近親相姦タブーに触れるし、また、“Of course a Grierson would not think seriously of a Northerner, a day laborer” (124) とJeffersonの人々が言うように、旧南部貴族Emilyが北部の肉体労働者Homerと深い関係になることもタブーだといえる。

以上のように、Emilyにとっては彼女の父親とHomerは実は似た者同士である。南北戦争後も貴族であろうとするEmilyは、旧南部を支配していた父権制にとらわれるあまり〈父親〉に過剰に拘泥し、父親に似たHomerを強く求めるのだが、無論彼女の愛は実を結ぶはずもなく (“Barron”は“barren（不毛の）”と同じ発音）、彼女は、父親の遺体を手放そうとしなかったようにHomerの死体を手元に置いておくことしかできない。結局のところEmilyは父権制の犠牲者なのである。

このEmilyとGone with the Windの主人公Scarlett O’Haraは、同じく南部貴族の末裔であるが、一見対照的な存在であるかのように見える。というのも、Emilyと異なりScarlettは、男たちを振り回す自立した逞しい女性のように描かれており、また、Howard Harperも述べているように（309）、父権制を尊重するMelanie Wilkesや母Ellenと同じ道を歩むことをしばしば避けようとするからである。しかしながら、実はScarlettも、Emilyと同様、父権制に執拗するあまり虚しく父親的な人物を追い求めている。この点について以下で詳しくみていくたい。

まず、“[Scarlett] was his [Gerald’s] oldest child and, now that Gerald knew there would be no more sons to follow the three who lay in the family burying ground, he had drifted into a habit of treating her in a man-to-man manner which she found most pleasant” (49) とあるように、息子のいないO’Hara家の当主Geraldは、長女Scarlettを跡取り息子として扱っている。そして、Scarlettは、以下のように、父親から受け継いだTaraの大農園を、〈跡取り息子〉として守ろうとする。

When she looked at Tara she could understand, in part, why wars were fought. . . . These were the only things worth fighting for, the red earth which was theirs and would be their sons’, the red earth which would bear cotton for their sons and their sons’ sons.

The trampled acres of Tara were all that was left to her, now that Mother and Ashley
were gone, now that Gerald was senile from shock, and money and darkies and security and position had vanished overnight. As from another world she remembered a conversation with her father about the land and wondered how she could have been so young, so ignorant, as not to understand what he meant when he said that the land was the one thing in the world worth fighting for.

“For ’tis the only thing in the world that lasts . . . and to anyone with a drop of Irish blood in them the land they live on is like their mother . . . ’Tis the only thing worth working for, fighting for, dying for.”

Yes, Tara was worth fighting for, and she accepted simply and without question the fight. No one was going to get Tara away from her. No one was going to set her and her people adrift on the charity of relatives. She would hold Tara, if she had to break the back of every person on it. (413-14，下線は筆者による)

このように、Scarlett は、旧南部の大農園 Tara に、そしてそれを支えていた父権制に過度に執着している。その結果（父親）を強く追い求め、父親に似た人物 Ashley Wilkes に夢中になっているのである。3 “Our people and the Wilkes are different” (53) と Gerald が言うように、一見 Ashley は Gerald とは違うタイプの人間であるかのようにみえるが、実は二人には類似点が多いある。

まず、“Filled with her own anxieties, she [Scarlett] nevertheless watched him with affectionate pride, for Gerald was an excellent horseman” (48)、“[Ashley] was the best rider in the County” (39) とあるように、Gerald も Ashley も非常に優れた騎手である。また、“Beneath his choleric exterior Gerald O’Hara had the tenderest of hearts. He could not bear to see a slave pouting under a reprimand, no matter how well deserved, or hear a kitten mewing or a child crying” (49) という描写が示すように、Gerald は、弱者が虐待されるのを見ていられないほど極めて心のやさしい人物だが、Ashley も、Scarlett の工場で働く囚人たちが虐待されるのを見るに忍びず、莫大な利益を生み出す彼らを利用することを拒絶するほど非常に思いやりのある人物といえる。さらに、次のように Gerald と Ashley は全く同じ結婚観を Scarlett に説いている。“I [Gerald] want my girl to be happy and you wouldn’t be happy with him . . . Only when like marries like can there be any happiness” (53)、“Love isn’t enough to make a successful marriage when two people are as different as we [Scarlett and Ashley] are . . . Can’t I make you see that a marriage can’t go on in any sort of peace unless the two people are alike?” (129)。そして、いとこ同士で結婚するという Wilkes 家の「習慣'
Night after night, when Scarlett went to bed after sitting on the front porch in the semi-darkness with him, she tossed restlessly for hours and comforted herself only with the thought that the very next time he saw her he certainly would propose. But the next time came and went, and the result was nothing—nothing except that the fever possessing her rose higher and hotter” (46).

Scarlett は、Ashley が Melanie と結婚して子供をもうけても、自分自身が何度も結婚して何人も子供を産んでもなお Ashley を求め続ける。

She belonged to Ashley, forever and ever. She had never belonged to Charles or Frank, could never really belong to Rhett. Every part of her, almost everything she had ever done, striven after, attained, belonged to Ashley, were done because she loved him. Ashley and Tara, she belonged to them. The smiles, the laughter, the kisses she had given Charles and Frank were Ashley’s, even though he had never claimed them, would never claim them. Somewhere deep in her was the desire to keep herself for him, although she knew he would never take her. (775)

父親と同様「立派な」(670, 859) 南部貴族であり、なおかつ父親と同じく結婚することができない Ashley に Scarlett は夢中になっているのである。だからこそ、Ashley を頼むと言って Melanie が死んできたことにより Ashley と結婚できる段になると、Scarlett は急に心変わりして今度は、Scarlett との結婚を解消しようとすると Rhett Butler を追いかけ始める。Melanie が死んで Ashley を手に入ることを何年も前からしきりに願っていたにもかかわらず、である (478, 940)。

今や、Scarlett にとって父 Gerald に似た人物とは、結婚できるようになった Ashley ではあり得ず、彼女と実質的に離婚する意思を固めた Rhett なのである。結婚生活を営むことができないという点以外にも Gerald と Rhett の共通点は多い。二人とも型破りな南部貴族であり、「躍動的な自信、厚かましさ、絶え間ない活力」 (415) および卓越したポーカーの腕前によって身一つで財を成した。また、“[There] can’t ever be happiness except when like mates like” (870) という Rhett の結婚観は Gerald のそれと全く同じである。そして、Rhett は、父親の様にしばしば Scarlett を慰めたり助けたりしている。

*Gone with the Wind* の物語のその後の展開を予測すると、このまま Rhett が Scarlett との
When she arose at last and saw again the black ruins of Twelve Oaks, her head was raised high and something that was youth and beauty and potential tenderness had gone out of her face forever. What was past was past. Those who were dead were dead. The lazy luxury of the old days was gone, never to return. And, as Scarlett settled the heavy basket across her arm, she had settled her own mind and her own life.

There was no going back and she was going forward.

Throughout the South for fifty years there would be bitter-eyed women who looked backward, to dead times, to dead men, evoking memories that hurt and were futile, bearing poverty with bitter pride because they had those memories. But Scarlett was never to look back.

She gazed at the blackened stones and, for the last time, she saw Twelve Oaks rise
before her eyes as it had once stood, rich and proud, symbol of a race and a way of living.

(407-08)

しかししながら、その直後、下記のように、さっそく旧南部を振り返っている。下記の“the quarters”とは、黒人奴隷の居住地のことである（Brown 157）。

Sometimes, in the days of backbreaking work, in the desperate struggle for food and the never-ceasing care of the three sick girls, Scarlett found herself straining her ears for familiar sounds—the shrill laughter of the pickaninnies in the quarters, the creaking of wagons home from the fields, the thunder of Gerald’s stallion tearing across the pasture, the crunching of carriage wheels on the drive and the gay voices of neighbors dropping in for an afternoon of gossip.” (408)

Scarlettは、その後も繰り返し旧南部への郷愁に浸っている。 “As the girls drove back to Tara, Scarlett was silent for a while, thinking of what she had seen in the various homes, remembering against her will the County in its glory, with visitors at all the big houses and money plentiful, negroes crowding the quarters and the well-tended fields glorious with cotton” (467-68)、 “Oh, lazy days and warm still country twilights! The high soft laughter from the quarters! The golden warmth life had then and the comforting knowledge of what all tomorrows would bring!” (856)、“Suddenly she wanted Mammy [a former slave] desperately, as she had wanted her when she was a little girl, wanted the broad bosom on which to lay her head, the gnarled black hand on her hair. Mammy, the last link with the old days” (959)。

そして、Thomas Leitchも述べている通り、Scarlettが恋い焦がれたAshleyは、彼女にとって旧南部の象徴である(131)。 “That was Southern chivalry. A gentleman always obeyed the rules and said the correct things and made life easier for a lady” (187)とあるように、旧南部社会の基盤には父権制と結びついた「騎士道」精神があったが、Scarlettは、繰り返しAshleyを「騎士」になぞらえている。 “He was still a young girl’s dream of the Perfect Knight and her dream asked no more than acknowledgment of his love, went no further than hopes of a kiss” (215)、“The bright new sheen of the gray coat was sadly at variance with the worn and patched butternut trousers and the scarred boots, but if he had been clothed in silver armor he could not have looked more the shining knight to her” (266)、“She stood back and viewed him with pride, thinking that even Jeb Stuart with his flaunting sash and plume could not
look so dashing as her cavalier” (267)。そして、下記の描写も暗示するように、Scarlett が愛していたのは、Ashley そのものではなく、彼らが体現する「騎士道」精神に基づく旧南部だったのである。

“He never really existed at all, except in my imagination,” she thought wearily. “I loved something I made up, something that’s just as dead as Melly [Melanie] is. I made a pretty suit of clothes and fell in love with it. And when Ashley came riding along, so handsome, so different, I put that suit on him and made him wear it whether it fitted him or not. And I wouldn’t see what he really was. I kept on loving the pretty clothes—and not him at all.”

Now she could look back down the long years and see herself in green flowered dimity, standing in the sunshine at Tara, thrilled by the young horseman with his blond hair shining like a silver helmet. (940，下線は筆者による)

作品の最後で Scarlett が、旧南部の象徴 Ashley に代わって追い求める Rhett は、一見、旧南部の象徴どころか、むしろ旧南部の伝統に批判的な人物であるようにみえる。確かに以前の Rhett はそうであったが、Leslie A. Fiedler も述べているように (59-70)，結局 Rhett は、Scarlett が Tara に帰郷するのと同様、彼の故郷 Charleston の伝統的な世界に帰帰しようとしている。

“. . . I want the outer semblance of the things I used to know, the utter boredom of respectability—other people’s respectability, my pet, not my own—the calm dignity life can have when it’s lived by gentle folks, the genial grace of days that are gone. When I lived those days I didn’t realize the slow charm of them—”

Again Scarlett was back in the windy orchard of Tara and there was the same look in Rhett’s eyes that had been in Ashley’s eyes that day. Ashley’s words were as clear in her ears as though he and not Rhett were speaking. Fragments of words came back to her and she quoted parrot-like: “A glamor to it—a perfection, a symmetry like Grecian art.”

Rhett said sharply: “Why did you say that? That’s what I meant.”

“It was something that—that Ashley said once, about the old days.” (956-57)

このように、今や旧南部への郷愁にどっぷり浸かった旧南部貴族 Rhett は、あたかも旧南部の象徴 Ashley が乗り移ったかのような存在と化している。その Rhett を追い求める
Scarlett の、ある意味希望に満ちた言葉—— “I’ll think of it all tomorrow, at Tara. I can stand it then. Tomorrow, I’ll think of some way to get him [Rhett] back. After all, tomorrow is another day”（959）——で Gone with the Wind は幕を閉じる。

Gone with the Wind と同じく旧南部の父権制に執着した女性を主人公とする “A Rose for Emily”が、その父権制を批判的に描いていることは、“What is the meaning of the title ‘A Rose for Emily’?”と質問された際の、“Oh, it’s simply the poor woman had had no life at all. Her father had kept her more or less locked up and then she had a lover who was about to quit her, she had to murder him. It was just ‘A Rose for Emily’—that’s all”（Gwynn 87-88）という Faulkner 自身の説明や、“Then we knew that this was to be expected too; as if that quality of her [Emily’s] father which had thwarted her woman’s life so many times had been too virulent and too furious to die”（127）という Emily と Homer の破局についての描写からも明らかである。一方 Gone with the Wind は、これまで考察してきたように、全体としては旧南部へのノスタルジーに満ち溢れた作品となっている。John M. Grammer によれば、Mitchell は自分がプランテーション神話への批判書を執筆していると信じていたし、また、それはある程度正しいが（59）、Gone with the Wind は結局は旧南部を肯定的に描いていると言わざるを得ない。

最後に、Faulkner と Mitchell の作品について人種の観点からも一言述べておきたい。Mitchell は、旧南部へのノスタルジーが横溢する Gone with the Wind において、黒人への差別（そしてリンチ）を正当化しているが、南部を美化しようとすればするほどその暗部に目を向けざるを得ない。そのジレンマゆえに、Mitchell は次作を書くことができなかったと考えられる。一方 Faulkner は、“A Rose for Emily”以降、南部社会への批判を強めていく。例えば、“Dry September”（1931）や Light in August （1932）では、黒人へのリンチを否定的に描いており、その後も、Absalom, Absalom!（1936）や Go Down, Moses （1941）など黒人差別や奴隷制度を正面から取り上げる作品を次々と発表していったのである。

注

1 南部の白人が黒人を「愚かで」「無能な」「子ども」とみなしていたことは、Gone with the Wind でも繰り返し描かれている。“How stupid negroes were! They never thought of anything unless they were told. And the Yankees wanted to free them”（390）、“Negroes were provoking sometimes and stupid and lazy.... ‘Always remember, dear,’ Ellen had said, ‘you are responsible for the moral as well as the physical welfare of the darkies God has intrusted to your
care. You must realize that they are like children and must be guarded from themselves like children, and you must always set them a good example” (447). “The mottled wise old eyes saw deeply, saw clearly, with the directness of the savage and the child, undeterred by conscience when danger threatened her pet” (561). “The more I see of emancipation the more criminal I think it is. It’s just ruined the darkies. Thousands of them aren’t working at all and the ones we can get to work at the mill are so lazy and shiftless they aren’t worth having” (597). “There they conducted themselves as creatures of small intelligence might naturally be expected to do. Like monkeys or small children turned loose among treasured objects whose value is beyond their comprehension, they ran wild—either from perverse pleasure in destruction or simply because of their ignorance” (611). “But they were, as a class, childlike in mentality, easily led and from long habit accustomed to taking orders” (611). “What damnably queer people Yankees are! . . . They did not know that negroes had to be handled gently, as though they were children, directed, praised, petted, scolded” (629).

2 顔は「男根」の象徴でもある（de Vries 498）。

3 Scarlett は父 Gerald ではなく母 Ellen に執着しているようにみえる箇所もあるが、その Ellen 自体が Gerald に完全服従している。

4 Scarlett が Ashley を愛するようになったのは、彼と Melanie の結婚の二年前からであるが（45）、Tarleton 兄弟と Tarleton 夫人の次の言葉からわかるように、Scarlett は、自分が Ashley と結婚できないことは何年も前から知っていた。 “But Scarlett must have known he was going to marry Miss Melly sometime. Why, we’ve known it for years. The Wilkes and Hamiltons always marry their own cousins. Everybody knew he’d probably marry her some day, just like Honey Wilkes is going to marry Miss Melly’s brother, Charles” (34). “Everybody’s known for years that Ashley would marry her [Melanie], that is, if he didn’t marry one of his Burr cousins from Macon. Just like Honey Wilkes is going to marry Melanie’s brother, Charles” (103).

5 Gone with the Wind には、あからさまに黒人を差別する表現が繰り返し登場する。 “Then Mammy was in the room, Mammy with shoulders dragged down by two heavy wooden buckets, her kind black face sad with the uncomprehending sadness of a monkey’s face” (396). “Those damned nigger lovers . . . Perhaps they’d even bring negroes here to dine and sleep. Will had told her [Scarlett] Jonas made a great to-do about being equal with the negroes, ate with them, visited in their houses, rode them around with him in his carriage, put his arms around their shoulders. When she thought of the possibility of this final insult to Tara, her heart pounded
so hard she could scarcely breathe” (507-08). “Free issue niggers are something else, and a
good whipping would do some of them a lot of good” (597). “We’ll do something about it if it
means another war. Soon we’ll be having nigger judges, nigger legislators—black apes out of the
jungle—” (604). “Now she knew what Reconstruction meant, knew as well as if the house were
ringed about by naked savages, squatting in breech clouts” (605). “Yes, things can get worse,
even worse than they are now. Suppose we have a darky legislature? A darky governor?” (706).
また、Alice Walker、Mary Conde、Toni Morrison、Gloria Naylor たちは、Gone with the Wind
における受け身で満足した黒人奴隷のステレオタイプ的な描き方に対して間接的に非難
している（Haskell 6）。同作品において黒人奴隷制度を正当化する描写は次の通りである
（本論文の注 1 も参照）。“They kept the negroes stirred up with tales of cruelty perpetrated by
the whites and, in a section long famed for the affectionate relations between slaves and slave
owners, hate and suspicion began to grow” (492). “Slaves were neither miserable nor
unfortunate. The negroes were far better off under slavery than they were now under freedom,
and if she didn’t believe it, just look about her!” (708)。さらに、Gone with the Wind には、黒
人へのリンチや the Ku Klux Klan を擁護する箇所が多数ある (607, 608, 612-13, 695)。

引用文献
Fiedler, Leslie A. The Inadvertent Epic: From Uncle Tom’s Cabin to Roots. New York: Simon
and Schuster, 1980.
Grammer, John M. “Plantation Fiction.” A Companion to the Literature and Culture of the
Gwynn, Frederick L., and Joseph L. Blotner, eds. Faulkner in the University. Charlottesville: UP
of Virginia, 1959.
Harper, Howard. “Gone with the Wind.” The Companion to Southern Literature: Themes, Genres,
Places, People, Movements, and Motifs. Ed. Joseph M. Flora, Lucinda H. MacKethan, and


